

Shahzad Ali, 2017

Volume 3 Issue 2, pp. 787 - 808

Date of Publication: 18<sup>th</sup> September, 2017

DOI-<https://dx.doi.org/10.20319/pijss.2017.32.787808>

This paper can be cited as: Ali, S. (2017). *Portrayal of Civil and Military Leadership of Pakistan in the British Print Media: A Textual Analysis of the Guardian and Telegraph*. *PEOPLE: International Journal of Social Sciences*, 3(2), 787-808.

This work is licensed under the Creative Commons Attribution-Non-commercial 4.0 International License. To view a copy of this license, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc/4.0/> or send a letter to Creative Commons, PO Box 1866, Mountain View, CA 94042, USA.

## **PORTRAYAL OF CIVIL AND MILITARY LEADERSHIP OF PAKISTAN IN THE BRITISH PRINT MEDIA: A TEXTUAL ANALYSIS OF THE GUARDIAN AND TELEGRAPH**

**Shahzad Ali**

*Associate Professor, Department of Communication Studies, Bahauddin Zakariya University, Multan, Pakistan*

[shahzadmsscmm@bzu.edu.pk](mailto:shahzadmsscmm@bzu.edu.pk)

---

### **Abstract**

*The study aimed to explore representation of civil and military leadership of Pakistan in the two mainstream newspapers of the UK i.e. the Guardian and the Telegraph through the lenses of qualitative textual analysis. It analyzed 25 leading articles and byline stories as the sample was selected through purposive sampling technique. The study was theoretically linked Shoemaker and Rees's theory of influences on media contents and propaganda model of Herman and Chomsky. Overall mix representation of political leadership was explored with binary frames of popular charismatic leaders, puppets of military establishment, assertive, symbol of corruption and bad governance, champion of human rights, orthodox and fundamentalist, pro west, pro militant and ally of the US etc. The selected newspapers painted positive image of Farooq Ahmad Khan Laghari then President of Pakistan and Salman Tasser, governor of the province Punjab and paid tribute to him for raising his voice against the blasphemy law. While on the other hand the military leadership was framed with negative attributes as anti-democrat, disobedient to civilian leadership and as state within the state. Among the military leadership,*

*three- fourth coverage of General Ishfaq Pervez Kiyani was found neutral to military leadership. While the Chief of Army Staff, General Raheel Sharif was portrayed in favorable manners.*

### **Keywords**

*Pakistan, Civilian Leadership, Military Establishment, British Mainstream Newspapers, The Guardian, The Telegraph, Democratic Regimes, Image, Representation*

---

## **1. Introduction**

Since her independence, the relationship between political and military establishment has been remained central point of gravity for media persons and social scientists. The pages of political history of Pakistan divulge that fragile democratic process has been directly derailed four times through military interventions and takeovers. The military establishment remained in the driving seat of the helm of the affairs for more than three decades and also played vital role in influencing decision making when democratic forces ruled the country in the rest of the period.

This research paper comprised the two parts. In the first part of the study, the qualitative textual analysis of other political leaders during the democratic phase, before the military takeover of 1999 would be undertaken; In this specific phase, a few selected items related to Farooq Ahmad Khan Leghari, former President of Pakistan, Malik Meraj Khalid, former caretaker Prime Minister and Rafiq Ahmad Tarrar have been selected from the four selected newspapers. While in post Musharraf scenario, the way image of Yousaf Raza Gillani former premier and his successor Raja Pervez Ashraf have been constructed by the British media; it would be briefly discussed in terms of qualitative analysis. In addition to this, the representation of Imran Khan would be described in the context of his persona, elections campaign of 2013, issue of drone strikes, closure of NATO supply route, the stance on Taliban and Freedom March against the current government of Mr. Sharif on the charges of rigging in the elections. It would also describe the sketch of MQM and his leader Altaf Hussain in the context of May 12 tragic incident and as ally of General Musharraf. It would also have focused on other political leaders including Maulana Fazalur Rehman, Salman Tasseer, former Governor of the province Punjab, Shahbaz Bhatti, former Federal Minister of Minorities, Sherry Rehman former Information Minister, Sheikh Rasheed Ahmad, former Minister of Information and Railway and Dr. Tahir ulQadri.

## **2. Literature Review**

The several studies have so far been conducted during cold war, after disintegration of former USSR and post September eleven phase in the perspective of Muslim world including Pakistan. As the findings of most of the studies based on quantitative and qualitative content analysis indicated that negative frames, pejorative phrases and representation of Muslim world was constructed through stereotypical lenses. However, the western media also highlighted some issues like misuse of powers, rigging in elections, political instability and corruption of the leadership with blend of objectivity. The research findings of Atheide (1976), Gans (1979), Gitlin(1980), Paletz & Entman, (1981),Hackett(1984),Yu and Riffe, (1988) ,

Chang's (1990) and other studies namely Entman (1993), Merrill (1995), Perlmutter (1998), Herman & Chomsky(2000), Dorogi ( 2001), Z. Peng (2004) endorse this perception that the coverage of international conflict has been found consistent with the interests and policy laid down by White House and Pentagon. It is an admitted fact, substantiated by the findings of various researches that Media coverage of foreign states often depicts the dominant ideology of the host country instead of the yardstick of newsworthiness, as Yu and Riffe (1988) in their research identified that the ideology is the driving force behind the news reporting rather than newsworthiness. Similarly, Hull (1989), Ramaprasad & Majid (1995) also endorse that apart from other factors (political, economic) ideology is one of the pivotal force which exert influence on production of news as a socially constructed product. In the light of findings of several others insightful critical research projects namely Lent, 1977; Yu and Riffe, 1988 Merrill, 1995; Chang, 1988, 1989; Dorogi, 2001, Ali & Qadir, 2005, Ali, 2008, 2009, Asmal, 2008 and Ali, 2012 the western mainstream media news coverage of international issues is largely based on foreign policy of the state. It can be said in convenient manners that the mainstream media by and large are considered to be a co-worker of the policy makers i.e. 10 Downing street, White House or military establishment and also supposed to be effective tool, medium to endorse and project national standpoint in foreign affairs as well as relationships with other countries

### **2.1 Statement of the Problem**

This study is designed to investigate news and editorial representation of Pakistani establishment in the mainstream newspapers of UK. Precisely speaking, it would focus on the nature and treatment of portrayal of Pakistani political and military establishment in particular in the two British prestigious newspapers Telegraph & the Guardian through textual analysis.The

study was theoretically linked Shoemaker and Rees's theory of influences on media contents and propaganda model of Herman and Chomsky.

### **3. Research Methodology**

In order to assess the representation of civil and military leadership in the British newspapers, textual analysis of 25 leading articles, byline stories and opinion articles have been undertaken. With the help of purposive sampling technique 18 published items on the said political leadership were selected while ratio of selected items on General Kiyani and Raheel Sharif was four and three articles respectively were analyzed. In addition to this different frames were also identified which cultivated representation of political and military leadership in favorable, unfavorable, or neutral way. On the basis of textual analysis, list of pejorative phrases has been prepared for better understanding of portrayal of both the leadership. The study has been designed in order to dig out answers of the following research questions:

- i. How the civil and military leadership of Pakistan was represented by the selected mainstream British newspapers?
- ii. Which binary frames were used while depicting civil and military establishment by the selected mainstream newspapers of the UK

#### **3.1 Favorable Framing of Farooq Leghari and Caretaker set up PM Malik Meraj Khalid**

The sketch of Mr. Farooq Ahmad Leghari as elected President of Pakistan was painted with positive slants as the Guardian highlighted his political journey with favourable fames, used the phrase of Oxford- educated president, neutral approach coupled with anti-corruption stance. Despite he was member of PPP and used to be loyalist of Benazir Bhutto but he didn't compromise on corruption and bad governance as well as preferred to use his constitutional powers instead of abettor or silent spectator on poor performance of his own political party who nominated and get elected him as president. See the following part of by line story which categorically communicates how he distanced himself from the premier and his advisory role to the government to act accordingly in context of curbing corruption and judicial appointment.

**He gradually distanced himself from the PPP. This summer he repeatedly warned Ms Bhutto to act against corruption and stop interfering in judicial appointments..**

In addition to this, appointment of Malik Meraj Khalid as caretaker prime minister was described with blend of positivity. He was depicted as pro democrat and veteran socialist and

founding member of ruling PPP. See the following part of the story which supports this argument in favor of acting premier.

**The new Prime Minister, Meraj Khalid, is a veteran socialist and PPP founder. Like President Leghari, his democratic credentials have gone unquestioned.** (By line story, the Guardian, November 6, 1996)

### **3.2 Austerity Measures taken by Care Taker Government were Framed Positively**

The Guardian in its story described austerity measures taken by the care taker government under the aegis of Malik Meraj Khalid in favourable manners. In this connections, the steps were positively discussed namely fifty percent cut in the salaries of ministers and other perks and trimming in government spending on privileges with regard to boarding, lodging and medical treatment. The newspaper also used the positive slants for discouraging VIP culture and treatment for cabinet ministers and high government officials on airport and the other places. See the following part of the story which highlights these measures with positive slants.

**Luxury waiting lounges have also been banned. The use of VIP lounges at the airports has become a measure of class status which is an anachronism in an Islamic and democratic order** (Byline, the Guardian November 8, 1996)

### **3.3 Framing of Mulana Fazalurn Rehman as sympathizer of Taliban and anti US leader**

The Guardian in its story of November 6, 2002 has objectively discussed the nomination of Maluna Fazalur Rehman as candidate of opposition parties for premiership after 2002 general elections when MMA emerged as the third largest political force in the lower house. The newspaper described his nomination as eye opener for the United States. He was portrayed as sympathizer of Taliban and his anti-American stance with regard to war on terror was also discussed with critical tone. See the following part of the story which endorses these arguments and also depicts the persona of Maulana in catchy way.

### **3.4 MQM framed as Anti-Militant/Jihadi and Progressive Political Party**

In context of peace agreement of the government under the leadership of Zardari with the militant's groups, MQM was the only political party which raised her voice on the platform of the parliament and termed it that Islamabad was buying peace on dictation of militants through gun power. MQM was framed as ant militant, progressive and secular political party. See the following direct quotation of Mr. Farooq Sattar, parliamentary leader in the lower house which

reflects their agenda of moderate and liberal country as positively framed by the Guardian in her story.

**This will have far reaching consequences for the idea of a moderate and liberal Pakistan**

(By line story, the Guardian, April 14, 2009)

### **3.5 Framing of MQM as Extortionist, Violent and Law Violator for Illegal Armed Activities**

MQM was objectively depicted as ethnic political party of Urdu speaking descendant of refugees from India as they settled in Karachi at the time of the partition in 1947. The story also framed MQM as extortionist, violent and involved other anti-social activities. See the following part of the story which conspicuously paint the objective images of MQM in light of accusation leveled against them.

**The party has long been accused of having an illegal armed wing involved in Karachi's criminal economy of drugs, extortion and land theft.** (By line, the Guardian, May 20, 2013)

### **3.6 Altaf Hussain was Portrayed as Popular Leader**

The newspaper also framed Altaf Hussain as popular leader of Karachi who infused enthusiasm in his party workers despite he spoke telephonically from London. In addition to this, his grip on political and management affairs of party was discussed positively and his great influence on the politics of Karachi as he could declare shutter down strike as he desired. See the following part of the story which reflects Altaf Hussain as popular leader with commanding position in his political party

**Mr Hussain's telephonic rallies regularly draw crowds of thousands, as he fires up party supporters from 5,000 miles away.** (By line, the Telegraph May 20, 2013)

### **3.7 Gillani was Framed Objectively as Law Violator and Disrespectful to SCP**

Yousaf Raza Gillani was objectively framed as law violator and disrespectful to SCP as he defied the orders of the court with regard to writing a letter as chief executive to Swiss authorities to reopen the corruption case of 60 million US dollars against Mr. Zardari, then president. The newspaper has also included the version of Mr. Gillani as he defied on the pretext of Mr. president has constitutional immunity from prosecution in any court of law. See the following excerpt of the story which reflects objective narration of verdict of SCP as Mr. Gillani was convicted in the said case

### **3.8 Raja Pervez Ashraf was framed as Corrupt Politician**

Raja Pervez Ashraf was framed as corrupt politician as apex court ordered to arrest him on the charges of corruption. While the newspaper created this impression that the democracy in Pakistan could be derailed because of Sit in of thousands of supporters of Tahir ulQadri were gathered to there to get rid of corrupt system. See the following part of the story which show grave concern of the newspaper regarding future of fragile democracy in the country where one premier i.e. Yousaf Raza Gillani was dismissed by the court on contempt charges and his successor was also in the trouble water in the same case of writing letter to Swiss authorities for reopening of case against Mr. Zardari, then president of Pakistan.

**SCP ordered the arrest of the PM, Raja Pervaiz Ashraf, on corruption charges, heightening fears that the country's fragile democracy could be derailed by the campaign of tens of thousands of anti-corruptions protesters .....**

### **3.9 Civil Institutes were framed as Dysfunctional in comparison of armed forces: Mr. Qadari as Backed by the Establishment**

The story also highlights the stance of Mr. Qadri, as the newspaper observed balanced and fair approach, he was of the view that the civilian government has been failed to deliver due to her incompetency and corruption. Mr. Qadrai eulogized the meritorious contribution of military establishment and the higher judiciary as messiah and these two were rendering their duties diligently and honestly. This impression was also created that Mr. Qadri was in Islamabad as backed by the establishment. See the following part of the story based on direct quotation of Mr. Tahir ulQadri in support of judges of apex court and Pakistan army.

**There are only two institutions in Pakistan that are functioning and doing their duties of the people.** (By line story, the Guardian, January 16, 2013)

### **3.10 IK was Framed as Popular and Honest Leader with Clean Image**

During general elections, political campaign, Imran Khan was portrayed as anticorruption crusader, popular leader of youth and was presented as third contender and a threat for the two mainstream political parties i.e. PML (N) and PPP. However, the newspaper also mentioned his anti US stance and his political views regarding Taliban as he was presented as a leader who was against foreign policy of the country as a coalition partner with the west in war on terror. See the following part of the story which endorse this argument and paint his sketch as Mr. Clean who has not followed the path of tradition politicians.

### **3.11 Imran Khan was discussed critically for Anti US stance and conservative approach as well as pro Islamists**

The Guardian in its story narrated of transformation of Imran Khan from his liberal style of life turning to religion as the newspaper used the phrases of playboy and conservatism. See the following part of the story which endorse this argument.

**Once known as a playboy, the 60-year-old has raised eyebrows in the west with a new faith and conservatism**

(By line, the Guardian, May 4,2013)

The newspaper also critically discussed his anti US stance and his demonstration against drone strikes as he was critical of Islamabad policy as coalition partner in war on terror. He was also framed as pro Islamists.

### **3.12 Imran Khan was framed positively as Popular Leader of the Youth**

The Guardian in its story on the results of general elections depicted Imran Khan as popular leader of youth and also discuss his contribution of galvanizing them to participate in political process with great enthusiasm and gusto. The newspaper also has given credit to him for electrifying the election campaign which yielded in enhancement in voting turnout. See the following part of the story which supports these arguments with positive image of Imran Khan

**Khan has also been credited with politicizing many of Pakistan's vast number of young people and encouraging them to vote in an electrifying election** (By line, the Guardian, May 13, 2013)

### **3.13 Imran Khan, Taliban, NATO supply line and US aid**

Killing of Taliban leader Hakimullah Mehsood in drone strike and in response the provincial government of PTI in the province of KPK passed the resolution to block NATO supply line. The newspaper described the reaction of Imran Khan furious as he bracketed the killing of Mr. Mehsood with derailing of peace process with Taliban. The story further played up finical implication of the provincial and federal government of Pakistan with regard to closing of supply route and the US aid as by and thirty percent of KPK budget in the context of development assistance were received from the US donors as well as collectively 2.6 billion US dollars for federal government would yet to be released as it was frozen due to confrontation between both the countries on the certain issues. However, this impression was created that the provincial government would not go at extreme due to financial levers. See the following part of

the story which further clarify the stakes of PTI government in the context of policy on NATO supply route.

### **3.14 Imran Khan Claim of Rigged Election was Undermined between the lines Demand of Civil Disobedience was Criticized**

The Guardian in its by-line story on the subject of Freedom March by PTI under the leadership of Imran Khan, described this political turmoil by adopting critical approach. The qualitative analysis of the story communicates that the accusation of PTI in the context of rigging of general elections of 2013 were not presented in supportive manners as the newspaper tried to undermine the claim of Imran Khan by declaring the elections comparatively transparent in the political history of Pakistan. See the following part of the story which supports this argument.

**... International observers said the election had been the cleanest in the country's history.**

The newspaper further criticized the civil disobedience of Imran Khan and highlighted its detrimental implication on economy of the country which has been already in pathetic conditions. The announcement of civil disobedience was critical discussed as the phrase of ridiculous was used in this context. IMF official had to cancel their trip due to demonstration of PTI See the following part of the story which reflects if revenue would not be generated through Taxation, it would be a great challenge and its negative consequences in shape of international obligations.

**The failure to raise significant revenue in tax is one of Pakistan's main governance challenges.**(By line, the Guardian, August 18, 2014)

### **3.15 Military Establishment was framed negatively for registering case of terrorism against MQM**

The daily Telegraph to some extent sided with MQM chief Altaf Hussain as a case was registered against him, the impression was created it was done for criticizing the military establishment. The story further highlighted the version of Mr. Altaf Hussain who accused the paramilitary forces for physical torture and killing of his workers in Karachi. See the following part of the story which is self-explanatory in this context.

**Police in Pakistan have registered an alleged terrorism case against the London-based leader of a political party after he criticized the country's powerful military establishment.** (By line, the daily Telegraph, July 15,2015)

#### **4. Concluding Remarks**

On the basis of the qualitative analysis of the said political leaders, it can be sum up conveniently, by and large, the selected newspapers have portrayed image of the other leaders with mixed frames were used in order to depict positive and negative attributes, to some extent with blend of objectivity. Mr. Farooq Ahmad Leghari, former president was framed as highly educated, honest, law abiding and straight forward leader Despite he was member of PPP and used to be loyalist of Benazir Bhutto but he didn't compromise on corruption and bad governance as well as preferred to use his constitutional powers instead of abettor or silent spectator on poor performance of his own political party who nominated and get elected him as president. The selected newspapers used favourable frames while discussing the steps taken by the caretaker cabinet under the leadership of Malik Meraj Khalid. In this context, the cabinet members were portrayed positively with regard to austerity measures taken by the caretaker government.

Mr. RafiqTarrar, president of the country during the second term of Mr. Nawaz Sharif as he was framed as puppet of the prime minister. In addition to this, he was also depicted as fundamentalist Muslim between the lines due to his orthodox religious views on minorities and women. In post Nawaz Sharif scenario, after the military takeover on October 12, 1999, the military establishment didn't dismiss the President RafiqTarrar. However, this impression was created that they never trusted him as he was considered the supporter and loyalist of the deposed premier.

During the military government of General Musharraf, the opposition parties nominated Maulana Fazalur Rehman leader of JUI and MMA as candidate for premiership, the selected newspaper described his nomination as eye opener for the United States. He was portrayed as sympathizer of Taliban and his anti-American stance with regard to war on terror was also discussed with critical tone. As far as image of the leadership of PML (Q) was concerned, the cabinet member of PML (Q) Sheikh Rasheed Ahmad, Chaudhry Pervez Ilahi and Chaudhry Shujat Hussain were objectively painted as close ally of Musharraf. However, the top leadership of PML (Q) distanced themselves from the former military leader before the elections of 2013 as the grip and popularity of president Musharraf was at the lowest ebb due to lawyers' movement, emergency rule, NRO deal with Benazir Bhutto and Red Mosque operation. .

As far as overall representation of Karachi based political party MQM was concerned, the selected newspapers by and large used objective phrases while constructing her image which was varied from issue to issue. MQM was framed as popular, pro Musharraf, well organized and violent political party. For instance, during the military rule it was categorically framed as pro Musharraf party and also objectively paint her image as violent party as she allegedly involved in violence of May 12, 2007 on the eve of arrival of dysfunctional CJ of SCP which resulted in killing of several dozen supporters of different political parties. Overall, the party Chief Altaf Hussain who has been in London as self-exiled for the last twenty years was portrayed as popular leader of Karachi and his grip on running affair of the party was objectively discussed. While, the negative attribute of his personality was also presented i.e. his erratic behavior which was a source of embarrassment for party officials in Karachi. On the issue of militancy and extremism, MQM was framed as anti-militant/Jihadi and progressive political party. While their conduct in Karachi with regard to involvement in anti-social and illegal activities, the selected newspapers by and large with consensus represented her with unfavorable frames but with blend of objectivity as extortionist, violent and law violator for illegal armed activities.

Likewise, mix representation of Mr. Yousaf Raza Gillani was described. In post Benazir Bhutto scenario when he was nominated as Prime Minister of Pakistan, the positive frames while painting his sketch as uncompromising and courageous leader. His victory against the candidate of PML (Q) was presented as substantive evidence of his strong credential as anti-establishment. While on the other hand, when he defied the orders of SCP with regard to presidential immunity and writing a letter to Swiss authorities, Mr. Gillani was framed objectively as law violator and disrespectful to apex court. While his successor premier, Raja Pervez Ashraf was also framed as corrupt politician as the apex court ordered to arrest him on the charges of corruption in rental power case.

The overall image of Imran Khan was based on mix representation as comprised of positive and negative slants as well. However, there was consensus among the selected newspapers on his honesty and popularity as he was dominantly portrayed as Mr. clean, charismatic leader and popular leader of the youth. On the other side of the flip which reflects murky images of Mr. Khan in the context of his roadmap for peace initiative while supporting dialogue process with Taliban was another area of unanimity among the selected newspapers as leader of PTI Imran Khan was critically discussed for his Anti US stance and conservative

approach as well as the frame of pro Islamists was used. While his role as a catalyst for political socialization and mobilization of youth was acknowledged, he was also appreciated for his contribution of galvanizing the youth to participate in political process with great enthusiasm and gusto with frames of hero of the youth, charismatic leader and savior of the country. However, on closure of NATO supply route, he was presented as anti US and Taliban Khan and hard liner. While when he obeyed the order of the Peshawar High Court which ruled the closure of the route through protest as unconstitutional. In this connection, the opening of NATO supply route by the provincial government of PTI under the leadership of Imran Khan was acknowledged as he was framed law abiding leader. In addition to this, Imran Khan high Claims of rigged election was undermined between the lines and demand of civil disobedience was also criticized. In this context of political turmoil, he was held responsible and framed as anarchist between the lines and *dharna* or Freedom March was discussed in negative connotation. This impression was created that he has been colluding with the military establishment in order to destabilize the government of Mr. Sharif.

The selected newspapers painted positive image of Salman Tasser, governor of the province Punjab and paid tribute to him for raising his voice against the blasphemy law. He was framed as secular, moderate, progressive and courageous leader while the newspaper objectively paint the scenario the way assassin Mumtaz Qadri was warmly received in the court of magistrate as showered with rose petals. The military establishment was criticized on assassination of Mr. Shahbaz Bhatti, Federal Minister of Minorities as he was vocal against extremist groups. Likewise, Sherry Rehman was positively framed as human rights campaigner and her image was sketched as strong lady with liberal views. She was depicted as harbinger of emancipation of women, freedom of speech and media as well as great advocate of equal rights of minorities.

Last but not the least, Dr Tahir ul Qadri of PAT (Pakistan Awami Tehreek) was painted as great orator, symbol of Sufi Islam and anti-Taliban. While his two political protests, one against the government of Mr. Zardari and the second against Mr Sharif, as his political party PAT collaborated with PTI of Imran Khan in historical sit in, the selected newspapers described his agenda with critical tone. Like Imran Khan, he was also accused for having close association with the military establishment as he also used the same tactics against the previous government of Mr. Zardari. He was represented as conspirator who has been working on the agenda of the intelligence agencies as the present political crisis emerged due to Sit in would be used by the

military establishment in order to pressurize Mr. Sharif for their vested interests. On the whole, this impression was prevailed that the establishment emerged as victorious as they achieved their targeted objectives and to some extent side-lined Mr. Sharif on the matters of foreign affairs, security issues and high treason case against the former military leader.

#### **4.1 Portrayal of Military Leadership**

In this part of the study, the qualitative content analysis of the selected items published about the three chiefs of army, first General Jahangir Karmat as he was predecessor of General Musharraf; second, General Ishfaq Pervez Kiyani, he was successor of the military ruler, General Musharraf; third, General Raheel Sharif as successor of General Kiyani have been discussed in light of various frames as used by the four selected newspapers in order to depict the sketch of these top brass of Pakistan army in pre and post Musharraf phase.. In this connection, several issues including resignation of General Jehangir Karamat, nature of civil military relations, profile of the three chiefs as mentioned above, have been qualitatively analyzed in mirror of framing of military establishment of Pakistan during the specific time period.

The Guardian in its by-line story adopted neutral tone on the subject of controversy between Army chief and Premier Nawaz Sharif which resulted in early retirement of General Jehangir Karamat. The military establishment was not pleased with the economic social and political policies of the government as the newspaper used the phrase of rebuking the prime minister by the COAS who was asking for power sharing as narrative was established in the story. The newspaper presented point of view of both the power players i.e. army chief and Mr. Sharif. However, the chief was represented as power hungry and a person who was dictating to the civilian government while Mr Sharif was portrayed as assertive leader who emerged as victorious who forced the general to step down. See the following par the story which paints the murky picture of the military establishment for her power sharing demand and Sharif as assertive leader.

**army chief has stepped down only**

**two days after rebuking PM, and calling on him to share power with the**

**Military. ...., which has spent half of its 51 years under military rule.** (By line, the Guardian, October 8, 1998)

#### **4.2 Army was criticized for remaining Silent on Passing of Shariah Bill by the Parliament**

Both the selected newspapers in its publication of October 10, 1998 about Shariah Bill described it a new Islamic order by Mr. Nawaz Sharif. This impression was created that new amendment would also override the constitution and the premier would become elected dictator.

It is quite interesting to mention here that the newspaper raised the question why the military establishment has done nothing to stop this amendment. See the following phrase which communicates the way the military leadership was criticized between the lines for not playing their role to influence the government in order to avoid her from such legislation which could cultivate radical Islam in Pakistani society.

#### **4.3 Army Generals having Soft Corner for Taliban were criticized**

The Guardian in its by line story portrayed the army generals with religious views in unfavorable manners because they were not supportive to General Pervez Musharraf 'decision to support the United States in war against militants. These generals were framed as hardliner as they were described as admirer of former military ruler General Zia as he was depicted as hardline dictator. In this story, the decision of General Musharraf to side-line anti American general was narrated with blend of positivity while the newspapers used the phrase of pious general in ironical style of diction as associated with General Aziz. See the following part of the story which reflects the way General Musharraf was able to sack the hardliner generals those maneuvering to remove General Musharraf in counter coup as General Yousaf and General Aziz were framed as loyalist to General Musharraf.

**General Musharraf consolidated his grip on power by swiftly sacking two of his most senior generals, in an attempt to head off a growing revolt within the army against his pro-American policies.**

(By-line story, the Guardian, January 2, 2002)

#### **4.4 General Kiyani was framed as Professional Soldier with Positive Tone**

The Guardian in its by-line story on nomination of General Kiyani as new army chief as successor of General Musharraf has presented his persona with positive tone with ingredients of the phrases such as professional soldier, humble person, capable general and pleasant gentleman. See the following part of the story which cultivate positive image of new chief.

**Gen Kiyani, is regarded asa professional soldier and a capable political operator...Very down to earth, an absolutely delightful gentleman,"** (By line, the Guardian, October 3, 2007)

#### **4.5 Military establishment under the Leadership of General Kiyani was Framed Positively in comparison of General Musharraf in War on Terror**

Pakistan army under the command of General Kiyani launched successful anti-Taliban military action in Swat and South Waziristan while during the least years of General Musharraf the image of armed forces was so deteriorated on account of interference in political issues and

war on terror also couldn't produce desired results which affected popularity of army and eventually General Musharraf decided to get retirement as army chief under the pressure of political turmoil and influence of western key players. General Kiyani as new army chief took several measures for restoring the image of army including offensive action against TTP (Tehreek Taliban Pakistan).

#### **4.6 Failure of Military Rule in Resolving Menace of Corruption and Terrorism**

The successive military regimes in Pakistan during the last 63 years couldn't make the country politically stable, free of corruption as they seized powers through military takeovers on pretext of incompetency and corruption of the civilian leaders. The Telegraph in its editorial asked the question that the armed forces will have to prove that they could halt the disintegration process and rescue the country. The newspaper objectively highlighted that Pakistan was disintegrated during the military rule of General Yahya Khan. See the following part of the leading article which depicts visible sketch of failure of army in curbing corruption and resolving menace of terrorism.

**These military interventions have brought neither long-term stability nor an end to corruption, and it was under martial law that the nation suffered its greatest loss, the secession of the eastern wing.** (Editorial, daily Telegraph, October 19, 2009)

#### **4.7 Youth of Pakistan have more faith in Military in Comparison of Civilian Leadership**

The Guardian in its by-line story described the findings of survey as alarming and eye opener for strengthening of democracy in the country, based on opinion of youth regarding civilian and military leadership. Majority of the youth was not willing to trust on civilian leaders as they considered them corrupt and incompetent while they had believed in the institution of armed forces. Due to bad governance, they didn't have any charm for continuation of democracy and whatsoever the form of government irrespective of democracy or dictatorship, priority was employment, transparency and prosperity. See the following part of the story which categorically communicates faith of the youth in the military in comparison of civilian leadership.

**.60% said they had faith in the military as an institution while only one in 10 voted for President Zardari's beleaguered government.** (By line, the Guardian, November 21, 2009)

#### **4.8 Extension of General Kiyani as COAS for the Next Three Years: Positive Framing of General Kiyani**

The military action under the command of General Kiyani against Taliban was portrayed with positive tone. His professional approach for curbing militancy was acknowledged and his neutral role in the general elections of 2008 was also painted with favourable frames. The role of General Kiyani for restoration of democracy was also discussed positively. See the following part of the story which presents positive image of the chief in context of war on terror, democracy and politics as the newspaper used the phrase of soldier's soldier for the general coupled with frame of Mr. clean as well.

**Considered a "soldier's soldier", Kayani is respected for his professionalism. He is also credited with keeping the 2008 elections - which restored democracy to Pakistan after nine years of rule under his former boss, General Pervez Musharraf - relatively clean**

However, the newspaper described his extension as army chief with neutral tone; it was categorically communicated that the fragile civilian leadership took this decision under enormous pressure as the newspaper in objective manners used the phrase of unprecedented in the political history of the country. See the following phrase of the by-line story in the context of extension as COAS for the next three years as General was presented as powerful leader while the civilian was depicted as compromised or feeble

**General Kayani, emerged as a greatly strengthened figure after the fragile civilian government bowed to pressure to extend his tenure by an unprecedented three years.**(By line, the Guardian, July 24, 2010)

#### **4.9 General Kiyani was framed as Pro-Democratic and respectful to SC**

The selected papers used favorable frame for General Kiyani as he was presented as a chief who has no design to topple down the democratic regime through military coup despite unpopularity of the civilian government under the leadership of Zardari. Moreover, the military establishment was categorically described as respectful to SCP as pillar of state in the context of cases of corruption against the civilian leadership. See the following part of the story which reflect General Kiyani as pro democrat

#### **4.10 Military Establishment was framed as Corrupt**

The Guardian in its opinion article criticized the armed forces of Pakistan for extracting huge share from the national exchequer in the head of defense budget. The story also painted

negative pictures of the generals as they were involved in the corrupt practices while intruding into politics. See the following sentence which endorses this argument.

**The military is widely seen as relatively immune to corruption - though this usually ceases to be true when generals go into politics.** (Opinion article, the Guardian, January 20, 2012)

#### **4.11 The Military Establishment was framed as Anti-Democratic and Running state within a State**

In context of Memogate, as civil –military relations reached the lowest ebb in post Musharraf era; the military establishment was presented as anti-democrat. The establishment was framed as power hungry as the Guardian highlighted the version of civilian leadership in Memo Gate Inquiry Commission that the military establishment was described as a state within a state. See the following part of the by-line story in this context which blamed the armed forces for fragile democratic system in the country and desire for power was painted as driving force behind military coups.

**army of "running a state within a state" and roundly criticized the military for trying to destabilize government. Fearing reduction in its own power, the army has not allowed democracy to take root in Pakistan.** (By line, the Guardian, April 27, 2012)

#### **4.12 General Raheel Sharif was framed as Below Average Officer**

The sketch of General Raheel Sharif was painted in mixed manner with combination of positive and negative slants. He was presented as average officer who didn't deserve to be right choice as army chief and would not be instrumental in war against terrorism. In addition to this, the newspaper used the positive frame of anti-militant and he was described as gentleman See the following part of the story which categorically depicts the way negative representation was dominated in comparison of positive image of the general.

**Raheel Sharif was "a below-average officer" not well suited to lead a country in the midst of a war against militants.**

The story also highlights his relations with General Musharraf as the newspaper used the phrase of close ally. See the following excerpt of the story which communicates his relationship as well as his expertise in counterinsurgency warfare. .

**A close ally of former military dictator Pervez Musharraf, Raheel Sharif ..... as well as being involved in re-focusing Pakistan's army on counterinsurgency warfare against militants.....,** (By line, the Guardian, November 28,2013)

#### **4.13 NILC Corruption Scandal: Military under the Command of General Raheel Sharif was Framed Positively in Curbing Corruption in Comparison of his Predecessor General Kiyani**

The decision of General Raheel Sharif for expediting to dispose the case of NILC corruption scandal on the principle of speedy justice and transparency as he publicly shaming two retired senior officers of army on charges of misuse of funds. This case first brought to day light by PAC (Public Accounts Committee) in 2009 but during the tenure of General Kiyani, the investigation by the army against her own generals was succumbed to inordinate delay. The Guardian in its by-line story has framed the initiative of General Raheel to make army free of corruption with blend of positivity. See the following passage of the story which presents comparison between the two army chiefs in context of NILC corruption.

**Pakistan's army has taken the almost unheard of step of publicly shaming two retired generals for misusing funds, in a move many army-watchers applauded as a significant attempt by the country's top general to clean up corruption in the all-powerful institution....**

**(By line story, the Guardian, August 6,2015)**

**Concluding remarks:** On the basis of qualitative analysis of pre-andpost Musharraf military leadership including former army chiefs, it can be concluded that overall mix impression comprised positive and negative frames was created in the selected newspapers. However, on comparative grounds, the representation of the said military leadership with more negative attributes and frames than favorable depiction as divulged through qualitative content analysis. For instance, Army under the command of General JehangirKaramat was criticized for remaining silent on passing of Shariah bill by the Parliament during the second tenure of Mr Sharif as premier of the country. As the newspaper of the democratic and developed world raised the question why the military establishment has done nothing to stop the civilian democratically elected government from this amendment. While on the issue of resignation of General Jehangir Karamat, the newspapers sided with the civilian leader as the chief was represented as power hungry and a person who was dictating to the civilian government and meddling into the politics. In this issue, Mr. Sharif was portrayed with favorable frames as assertive leader who emerged as victorious by establishing the civilian supremacy over the military establishment. Similarly, the armed forces were painted in negative manners, as the newspapers adopted critical approach while blaming the establishment for extracting huge share from the national exchequer in the head of defence budget.

Among the military leadership, three- fourth coverage on General Ishfaq Pervez Kiyani was found neutral to military leadership. While the current Chief of Army Staff, General Raheel Sharif was portrayed in favorable manners and framed as professional soldiers as well as his stance against militants was acknowledged in the writings of the papers as 75 percent items were in support of the military. The qualitative analysis of General Kiyani as DG ISI and his six years as army chief in the four selected newspapers described mix impression. On nomination of General Kiyani as new army chief, the selected mainstream newspapers tried to cultivate his persona with positive tone with ingredients of the phrases such as professional soldier, humble person, capable general and pleasant gentleman in pre-operation Neptune Spear, he was framed as anti-militant, professional soldier, Mr. clean and popular army chief in comparison of his predecessor General Musharraf. This positive impression was constructed that Pakistan army under the command of General Kiyani launched successful anti-Taliban military action in Swat and South Waziristan while during the least years of General Musharraf the image of armed forces was so deteriorated on account of interference in political issues and war on terror also couldn't produce desire results which affected popularity of army. It can be said that overall negative picture of senior officers of army was painted as the generals were accused of corrupt practices while intruding into politics. General Kiyani was also framed as anti-democrat in context of Memo gate. The establishment was also framed as power hungry as the newspapers highlighted the version of civilian leadership in Memo Gate Inquiry Commission that the military establishment was depicted as a state within a state. In post OBL scenario, Chief of Army Staff, General Ashfaq Pervaz Kayani was also criticized as he was framed as a rigid and stubborn person who adopted more firm stance while dealing with the high ups of the United States. On the whole, it can be inferred that his professional approach for curbing militancy was acknowledged with objective tone and his neutral role in the general elections of 2008 was also painted with favourable frames. The role of General Kiyani for restoration of democracy was also discussed positively. Likewise, in the second general elections of 2013 during the six year tenure of General Kiyani, his policy of non-interference in continuation of democratic process was acknowledged positively as the newspapers represented the military establishment , to some extent with positive slants as General Kiyani decided not to manipulate by supporting any favourite political party.

In Asghar Khan Case on the issue of distribution of money among rightwing political parties in 90s, the military establishment was objectively criticized for meddling into politics and manipulating the results of general elections. In this context, the newspaper portrayed the images of former COAS General Mirza Aslam Beg with negative frames as he had to face music at the hands of the judges of apex court. The former army chief submitted written apology in the court for distribution of money as he instructed then DG ISI for this supporting certain rightwing political parties.

In the subject of human rights, the armed forces of Pakistan in general and the intelligence agencies in particular were depicted as human right abusers and held responsible for extra judicial killing of suspects in Baluchistan and during military operation of Swat. For instance, the officials of ISI in general were negatively framed for threatening, intimidating and murder of journalists as the media framed negatively DG ISI Lt. General Zaheerul Islam for the gun attack on Hamid Mir the anchor of private TV channel. ISI was also criticized for supporting certain TV channels as she was described as initiator in behind the scene for launching of Bol TV channel.

The qualitative analysis of the published items about the current Army chief General Raheel Sharif presented mix impression as he was positively framed as the most popular man in the country who was not desirous of lime light of media. General Raheel was positively represented as honest person who is desirous to see eradication of corruption from the army as his decision for expediting to dispose the case of NILC corruption scandal on the principle of speedy justice and transparency as he also publicly shamed the two retired senior officers of army on charges of misuse of funds was described with positive slants. In addition to this, he was also framed positively as anti-militant because the armed forces launched military action against the militant's groups after the tragic incident of 132 massacres of teenage school students of army public school, Peshawar as this incident was described as Nine Eleven of Pakistan. However, he was also described as average officer who didn't deserve to be right choice as army chief and would not be instrumental in war against terrorism.

Overall this impression was dominantly created that the successive military regimes in Pakistan during the last 63 years couldn't make the country politically stable free of corruption as they seized powers through military takeovers on pretext of incompetency and corruption of civilian leaders. Yet the newspapers highlighted the acceptance of military as popular phenomena

in the youth of Pakistan as eye opener and big threat for strengthening of democracy as majority of the youth was not willing to trust on civilian leaders as they considered them corrupt and incompetent while they had believed in the institution of armed forces.

### References

- Ali, M. (2012). 9/11 in British and Pakistani press: A comparative study with regards to myths and realities of hegemony and propaganda.
- Ali, S and Qadir, I (2005) "A critical study about the coverage of Islamic world in News Week and the Time magazine" *The Islamic culture*, Sheikh Zaid Islamic Center, University of Karachi of Vol. V. 5.2005 pp1-56
- Ali, S. (2008). US mass media and images of Pakistan: Portrayal of Pakistan by Newsweek and time magazines (1991-2001). *American Communication Journal*10(2).
- Ali, S. (2009). US mass media and image of Pakistan: portrayal of Pakistan by Newsweek and Time magazine 1991-2001. Retrieved from <http://eprints.hec.gov.pk/3026/>
- Asmal. (2008). Islam, Phobia and media: The portrayal of Islam since 9/11 and an analysis of
- Chang, T. K. (1989). The impact of presidential statements on press editorials regarding U.S.China. *Journalism and Mass Communication Quarterly*. 79(1).
- Chaudhry, N. (2012). *Pakistan's First Military Coup: Why Did the First Pakistani Coup Occur and Why Does it Matter?* (Thesis). Naval Postgraduate School. Retrieved from <http://hdl.handle.net/10945/6773>
- Dorogi, T. 1. (2001). *Tainted perceptions: Liberal-democracy and American popular images of China*. Lanham: University Press of American.
- Entman, R, M (2003) Cascading Activation: Contesting the White House's Frame after 9/11, *Political Communication*, 20:4, 415-432, <https://doi.org/10.1080/10584600390244176>
- Gans, H. J. (1979). *Deciding what news is: A study of CBS evening news, NBC nightly news, Newsweek and Time*. New York: Pantheon.
- Gitlin, T. (1980). The Whole World is watching. In Shoemaker, P. J & Reese, S. D. (Ed.), *mediating the Message: Theories of influence on Mass Media Content* (183-204). NY: Longman Publishing Group.
- Hackett, R. A. (1984). Decline of a paradigm? Bias and objectivity in news media studies. *Critical Studies in Mass Communication*, 1(3), 229–259. <https://doi.org/10.1080/15295038409360036>

Karim, K. (2000). *The Islamic peril: media and global violence*. Montreal: Black Rose Books.

Karim, K.H. (2002) Making sense of the Islamic Peril, *Journalism as Cultural Practice*, in

Paletz, D. L., & Vinson, C. D. (1994). Constructing content and delimiting choice: International coverage of KAL flight 007. *Argumentation*, 8, 357–366.

<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00733479>

Perlmutter, D. (1998). *Photojournalism and foreign policy: Framing icons of outrage in international crisis*. Westport, CT: Greenwood.

Rizvi, H. A. (2013). *The Military and politics in Pakistan 1947-1997*. Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications.

Yu, Yang-C. & Riffe, D. (1989). Chiang and Mao in U.S. news magazines. *Journalism* Taylor and Francis Group (Roli Book); PP:101-116

the Danish cartoon controversy in South Africa. Retrieved from

<http://scholar.sun.ac.za/handle/10019.1/3326>

[www.aiou.edu.pk/.../nine%20eleven%20british%20american](http://www.aiou.edu.pk/.../nine%20eleven%20british%20american)

Zelizer, Babbice, and Allan, Stuart (Ed) *Journalism, After September 11*, London: Routledge