TEACHING TOLERANCE IN INDONESIA: A STUDY ON THE MINISTRY OF EDUCATION YOUTUBE CHANNEL

Irawaty Irawaty
Ph.D, Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
irawaty@mail.unnes.ac.id

Rini Fidiyani
Ph.D., Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
rinif@mail.unnes.ac.id

Rindia Fanny Kusumaningtyas
M.H., Assistant Professor, Faculty of Law, Universitas Negeri Semarang, Indonesia
rindiafannykusumaningtyas@mail.unnes.ac.id

Abstract

This article investigates the maxim of tolerance based on the inspirators' opinion on tolerance which is stated clearly in each video related to Kant's moral theory and ways of teaching implemented by each inspirator in promoting tolerance. This research applies a qualitative approach. The data is taken by observing 4 videos, based on the number of views that contain tolerance, of the Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia Youtube Channel. The youtube channel name is Cerdas Berkarakter Kemdikbud RI. The playlist name which contains the teaching of tolerance is Kata Mereka (They Say). The method used in data analysis is content analysis. The findings of the research are: all inspirators' statements on tolerance satisfy the maxim of Kant's

view and all the inspirators implemented communication that create good and joyful interaction to establish tolerance to their audience/students.

Keywords

Teaching Tolerance, Youtube, Inspirators, Maxim, Beliefs, Respect

---

1. Introduction

Indonesia is one of the largest numbers of the population. It has more than 300 ethnic groups and more than 700 ethnic languages. To keep national ~~in~~ unity, Indonesia has Pancasila as the nation's philosophy and way of life. There are six religions acknowledged in legislation. However, many traditional beliefs are still embraced by the people.

Society is an important element of the state. What is more important is to have a society that can coexist peacefully. Fidiyani (2018) stated that conflict occurs not because of the teaching of religion but because of some believers who cannot accept different perspectives. Thus, one of the important things to maintain peacefulness in society is to have tolerance. Indonesia, as a country with a population of more than two hundred million people whose society is heterogeneous, is very important that all its societies have tolerance so that they can live side by side in peace.

One of the recent policies implemented by the Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia is named Merdeka Belajar--Kampus Merdeka (Freedom to Learn). There are some implications concerning the Freedom to Learn policy such as the mobility of students and the ability of higher education institutions to collaborate among them and with societies. (Rodiyah, 2021)

2. Literature Review

Tolerance is one of the most studied topics in Indonesia. The research uses a variety of perspectives. For example, research that uses the perspective of tolerance from the point of view of Islam (Said, 2017; Amin & Rosyidi, 2019; Usman & Widyanto, 2019; Hafidzi, 2019), Christianity (Harmadi, 2019; Mangantibe & Taliwuna, 2021), cross-religious (Fitriani, 2020), Inter-religious Diversity and Tolerance (Hutabarat & Panjaitan, 2016; Kaha, 2020), views of Gus Dur (a prominent figure in Indonesia. He was the fourth President of Indonesia and the leader of one of the biggest Islamic organization in the country) (Naim, 2016), certain levels of education and/or scholarship (Agung, 2013; Japar, Irawaty, & Fadhillah, 2019), certain communities

(Fidiyani, 2013; Hermawati, Paskarina, & Runiawati, 2016; Rahmah & Amaludin, 2021; Djuniasih & Kosasih, 2019), community development which is influenced by certain aspects (Ali-Fauzi, et al., 2017; Supriyanto & Wahyudi, 2017; Sodik, 2020; Hadisaputra, 2020; Abror, 2020; Purwati, Darisman, & Faiz, 2022; Dianita, Firdaus, & Anwar, 2018; Jena, 2019; Mayasaroh & Bakhtiar, 2020)

The idea of tolerance can be traced to the thoughts of two of the world's great philosophers, namely John Locke and Immanuel Kant. Locke's thoughts can be understood from his writings entitled Letter of Tolerance (1689), while his writings are entitled, Perpetual Peace. Furthermore, Petkova (2019) stated that tolerance is still very valid to be implemented until now. It is worth it to state that Derrida thought that Kant's stand, his thought based on Christianity, is not about tolerance but more on hospitality (Mengwei, 2012). Nevertheless, Kitcher (2003) stated that the maxim of tolerance according to Kant's view could be constructed by using a particular formulation. Asdi (1995) states that Kant's thoughts on moral philosophy are relevant to Pancasila. In addition, the teachings in Kant's moral philosophy can be equated with the meaning of tolerance in the Indonesian context.

Technology, especially social media, can be a medium that makes people hostile to each other (Digdoyo, 2018; Dewi & Triandika, 2020). Furthermore, Dewi & Triandika (2020) stated that a constructive message about the importance of tolerance in maintaining national unity through social media can influence the understanding and implementation of tolerance. In addition to that, Warsah et.al stated that social media also gives high impacts to spread religious teaching since there are no limitation of time and place. One of the technological advances that are used in learning is the social media platform Facebook which was declared effective as a learning medium by Irwin, Ball, Desbrow, & Leveritt (2012) based on their empirical research. Sutherland & Jalali (2017) who conducted empirical research on social media as a learning tool stated that compared to Facebook and Twitter, Youtube would not have as good an impact as the other two social media. However, Burke & Snyder (2008) through their research on the potential of using Youtube videos as additional learning material for health education students with several conditions, including lecturers must provide detailed information about what videos to watch. Chintalapati & Daruri (2017) have the same view regarding the use of Youtube as an additional learning resource and make a scale for measuring the effectiveness of the impact of using Youtube in learning. In connection, the use of Youtube as a learning medium can affect behavior stated by Zhou, et al

(2020). The use of social media platforms in learning has been going on for the past few years. Especially since the COVID-19 pandemic, the use of social media in online learning is a good choice. One of the most widely used social media platforms is YouTube.

Smith, et.al (2016) found that education has the largest impact to become a tolerant person. Teaching tolerance that could make students implement it in their daily lives is not an easy thing. Many things provide impacts on a person's acceptance of the concept of tolerance, let alone practice it in real life. Globally, the learning design for the 21st century is being able to coexist well with others. This can be realized if everyone has a tolerance. Casmana (2018) found that there are ways to teach tolerance, they are: discussing arguable relevant topics/cases, role plays, and/or meeting different religious believers. Nevertheless, it is also worth to express Treviño (2018) argued that students who have tolerance, in general, implements human rights values. The Ministry of Education of the Republic of Indonesia provides 11 inspirational videos about teaching tolerance that is shared by some practitioners and educators. The Youtube channel name is Cerdas Berkarakter Kemdikbud (Ministry of Education and Culture Smart Character). The videos are included in a playlist named *Kata Kita* (Our Say).

3. Scope of Study

The Government of Indonesia, in this case, the Ministry of Education and Culture, seeks to contribute to strengthening education regarding tolerance. Teaching used to be considered as activities to transform students in the same classroom. When the Covid-19 hit teaching must still be conducted using other methods and proper preparations (Khattapan, 2022). By using technological advances, namely social media with the Youtube platform, the Ministry shared videos about tolerance through the Kemdikbud Smart Character YouTube channel. There are quite some videos on this channel. But for tolerance, put in *Kata Kita* (Our Word) playlist, which contains 13 videos. Currently, the policy related to the COVID-19 pandemic that requires learning to be carried out online has been revoked. However, the use of the video to get inspiration on how to teach tolerance is certainly still relevant.

Technological progress cannot be denied from all dimensions of human life, including in learning. The percentage of teaching methods that can involve the use of digital technology is getting higher. One of the digital technologies used is social media platforms, for example, YouTube and even TikTok. Based on previous studies that are found online, there is no single

study that investigates the videos of *Kata Kita* which are analyzed with the Immanuel Kant theory. Thus, by considering those points, this paper aims to analyze the maxim of tolerance based on what the inspirators mean by tolerance related to Immanuel Kant's moral theory and the way of teaching tolerance applied to teach tolerance shared by the inspirators.

4. Research Method

The research method used in this study is a qualitative approach. Data collection was conducted by observing 13 videos contained in the Kata Mereka (They Say) Playlist, Smart Character Youtube channel of the Ministry of Education and Culture of the Republic of Indonesia. After observing all the videos, the videos that are used in this study were reduced to four. The videos that are used as the object of research are videos that have views above 50,000 each. The data collection time is 6:31-6:35 a.m. on October 14, 2022. Four videos have more than 50,000 views. Based on the order of the number of views, those videos are as stated in the table below:

Table 1: *Videos Are Used as Data Sources*

No	Title	Number of Views
1	Kata Mereka, Toleransi dan Keberagaman (They Say, Tolerance and Diversity)	85,363
2	Kisah Toleransi Menghargai Agama Orang Lain seperti Agama Sendiri dari Kabupaten Buleleng Singaraja (The Story of Tolerance Respecting Other People's Religions Like Your Own Religion from Buleleng Singaraja Regency)	70,263
3	Toleransi adalah Berempati Kisah Kreatif Toleransi di Kota Sukoharjo (Tolerance is Empathy the Creative Story of Tolerance in Sukoharjo City)	59,625
4	Kisah Toleransi dari Kabupaten Rokan Hulu (The Story of Tolerance from Rokan Hulu Regency)	58,685

(Source: Authors' Own Illustration)

The method used in data collection is by listening to video content based on predetermined categorizations. The videos' contents are analyzed manually.

5. Findings and Discussion

Based on the investigation of the videos that are chosen, below are the elaboration of the results and the discussion.

5.1. To depict the maxim of the inspirators regarding tolerance:

To be able to detect maxim, a sentence formula is needed. An example of the sentencing formula is "'if _____, I ought to (may, deserve to) _____'". The first underlined part is filled with conditional sentences while the second contains "action descriptions" (Kitcher, 2003)

1. *Kata Mereka, Toleransi dan Keberagaman* (They Say, Tolerance and Diversity):

   The opinion of what the inspirator, in that video whose name is Akbar Musfatir (a college student), means by tolerance is "*Kita mesti meyakini kebenaran kepercayaan yang kita pahami, akan tetapi di sisi lain kita harus menghargai kepercayaan orang lain*".

   (We must believe in the truth of beliefs that we understand, but on the other hand, we must respect the beliefs of others)

   The essence of the inspirator's statement is my own belief, respect, and other belief.

   Thus, the maxim of tolerance is based on the opinion of the inspirator's sentence depicted in the above formula: If someone had their own belief, I ought to respect his/her beliefs.

2. *Kisah Toleransi Menghargai Agama Orang Lain seperti Agama Sendiri dari Kabupaten Buleleng Singaraja* (The Story of Tolerance Respecting Other People's Religions Like Your Own Religion from Buleleng Singaraja Regency)

   The opinion of what the inspirator, in that video whose name is Gede Budi Astawa (a teacher), means by tolerance is "*Kebahagiaan sejati ketika kita melihat teman kita bahagia, kebahagiaan sejati ketika melihat keluarga kita semuanya senyum melihat kita bahagia*".

   (True happiness when we see our friends happy, true happiness when we see our family all smile seeing us happy)

   There are two different conditions based on the above statement, however the essence from the inspirators' statement: friends, family, happiness, smiling, my happiness based on.

   Thus, there are 2 (two) maxims of tolerance found from the opinion of the inspirator's sentence depicted in the above formula:

   a. 'If my friends were happy, I ought to be happy; and

   b. 'If my family was smiling, I deserve to be happy'.

3. *Toleransi adalah Berempati Kisah Kreatif Toleransi di Kota Sukoharjo* (Tolerance is Empathy the Creative Story of Tolerance in Sukoharjo City)

   The opinion of the inspirator, in that video whose name is Ninin Karlina (a teacher, an activist, a facilitator, and a researcher), means tolerance is "*Toleransi adalah menerima perbedaan*" ("Tolerance is accepting differences")

   The essence of the statement of the inspirator is accepting differences.

   Thus, the maxim of tolerance is based on the opinion of the inspirators' sentence depicted in the above formula: 'If there were different thoughts, I ought to accept the differences.'

4. *Kisah toleransi dari Kabupaten Rokan Hulu* (The Story of Tolerance from Rokan Hulu Regency):

   The opinion of what the inspirator, in that video whose name is Intania (a college student), means by tolerance is "*Semakin kita meyakini dan mengimani Tuhan kita sendiri, maka kita akan bisa menghargai perbedaan-perbedaan yang ada di luar kita*".

   ("The more we believe and have faith in our own God, the more we will be able to appreciate the differences that exist outside of us.")

   The essence of the inspirator statement is having more faith in our own God, able to respect differences.

   Thus, the maxim of tolerance is based on the opinion of the inspirator's sentence depicted in the above formula: 'If I would have a stronger belief in God, I ought to respect differences.'

Based on the above maxims which are depicted from each inspirator's statement, all satisfy Kant's thought that one should perform kindness regarding a condition in which one aimed to have a constructive condition (Potter Jr, 1994). Furthermore, it can be stated that Asdi's (1995) opinion that Kant's moral theory is in line with tolerance from the Indonesian perspective is satisfied. It is worth to be noted that the inspirators in the first and the fourth videos suggested that being kind and tolerant to others should be started by thoroughly understanding our religion. Their stands are in line with Gus Dur's view on tolerance. As stated in the section above that Gus Dur is one of the Indonesian prominent Islamic organization leaders and the fourth President of Indonesia as well (Naim, 2016).

5.2. The Depiction of ways in which each inspirator teaches tolerance.

As all the opinion of the inspirators satisfies Kant's theory on tolerance, thus it is important to depict how each of them teaches tolerance. Below are the elaborations on each depiction.

1. *Kata Mereka, Toleransi dan Keberagaman* (They Say, Tolerance and Diversity):

   Delivering the teaching by training directly to higher education students. But not only that, the inspirator and the team also went to remote areas of Sulawesi Island. The audience covered students of all levels of education, even early childhood education programs. However, when the Covid-19 pandemic hit, the teaching of tolerance was delivered online. The teaching methods were changed to be more suitable for the audiences.

2. *Kisah Toleransi Menghargai Agama Orang Lain seperti Agama Sendiri dari Kabupaten Buleleng Singaraja* (The Story of Tolerance Respecting Other People's Religions Like Your Own Religion from Buleleng Singaraja Regency)

   The inspirator teaches tolerance by giving understanding to his students about accepting the different views of other students. One of the ways that have been implemented regularly is by eating together. Each student brings food to the school. All different kinds of foods are collected and shared. Thus, the students learn about differences (regarding the variant of foods) and acceptance (the food that is shared should be eaten).

3. *Toleransi adalah Berempati Kisah Kreatif Toleransi di Kota Sukoharjo* (Tolerance is Empathy the Creative Story of Tolerance in Sukoharjo City)

   One of the ways of teaching that is implemented by the inspirator is by breaking down the walls. The audiences who have different religions (Islam and Christianity) are asked questions relating to their counterpart religion. The activity aims to get an explanation to deprive prejudice of other religions.

   The way that the inspirator implemented is in line with Gus Dur's view on one of the ways to establish tolerance, which is to omit negative thoughts about others (Naim, 2016).

4. *Kisah toleransi dari Kabupaten Rokan Hulu* (The Story of Tolerance from Rokan Hulu Regency):

   By establishing *Pondok Cerdas* (Smart Hut) which provided books. The books can be easily accessed by the target audience. The curriculum that is implemented is called *Kurikulum Keberagaman* (Diversity Curriculum). The inspirator and team teach tolerance to the audience by telling stories and playing.

Naim (2016) stated that according to Gus Dur, one of the strategies to establish tolerance is through communication. In the essence of each inspirator's way to establish tolerance to their audience is to create good and joyful communication. In addition to that, the communication that has been created could be characterized as harmonized interactions (Japar, et.al., 2019). In addition to that, the first inspirator applied appropriate remote teaching methods due to Covid-19 which is in line with what Khattapan (2022) suggested.

6. Suggestions for Further Research and Practice

The outcome of this research is to provide a way of thinking to establish tolerance by constructing a maxim based on Kant's view. Based on this study, future quantitative research with university students as respondents to depict the understanding of tolerance and identify them by the sentencing formula may be conducted by the authors. In addition to that, the ways of teaching tolerance implemented by the inspirators may be used as alternatives.

7. Conclusion

The Ministry of Education and Culture of Indonesia provides more than 10 (ten) videos on how to teach tolerance on their Youtube channel. The Indonesian people are multicultural; thus, it is very important to maintain the society's peacefulness by teaching tolerance. Based on Immanuel Kant's thinking, tolerance is an action taken by a person in responding to the situations and conditions he/she faces. The results of the identification of the views of the inspirators stated in the videos studied reveal that all of them show that their maxims were included in the formulation to identify tolerance based on Immanuel Kant's thinking. Regarding how the inspirators teach tolerance, they have different ways. Nevertheless, in essence, all of them established good and joyful communication. However, it is worth noting that this study did not measure the impact of the teaching of tolerance to the videos' viewers.

REFERENCES

A. Sandoval-Hernández et al. (eds.), Teaching Tolerance in a Globalized World, IEA Research for Education 4, pp. 33 - 66. https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-78692-6_4

Abror, M. (2020). Moderasi Beragama dalam Bingkai Toleransi: Kajian Islam dan Keberagaman. Rusydiah Jurnal Pemikiran Islam, 1(2), 143-155. https://doi.org/10.35961/rsd.v1vi2i.174

Agung. (2013). Peranan Pendidikan Kewarganegaraan dalam Membina Sikap Toleransi Antarsiswa. JPPUMA: Jurnal Ilmu Pemerintahan dan Sosial Politik UMA (Journal of Governance and Political Social UMA), 1(2), 12. https://doi.org/10.31289/jppuma.v1i2.563

Asdi, E. D. (1995). Imperatif Kategoris dalam Filsafat Moral Immanuel Kant. Jurnal Filsafat, 9-19. https://doi.org/10.22146/jf.31607

Burke, S. C., & Snyder, S. L. (2008). Youtube: An Innovative Learning Resource for College Health Education Courses. International Electronic Journal of Health Education, 1-8. https://eric.ed.gov/?id=EJ798652

Casmana, A. R. (2018). Perceptions of Indonesian Citizenship Teachers on Teaching Tolerance in Schools through Citizenship Education. Annual Civic Education Conference (ACEC 2018). 251, pp 505 - 515. Bandung. Atlantis Press. https://doi.org/10.2991/acec-18.2018.115

Chintalapati, N., & Daruri, V. S. (2017). Examining the Use of Youtube as A Learning Resource in Higher Education: Scale Development and Validation of TAM Model. Telematics and Informatics, pp 853-860. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tele.2016.08.008

Dewi, D. K., & Triandika, L. S. (2020). Konstruksi Toleransi pada Akun Media Sosial Jaringan Gusdurian. Lentera, 4 (01), 19-39. https://doi.org/10.21093/lentera.v4i1.2159

Dianita, G., Firdaus, E., & Anwar, S. (2018). Implementasi Pendidikan Toleransi di Sekolah: Sebuah Kearifan Lokal di Sekolah Nahdatul Ulama. Tarbawy: Indonesian Journal of Islamic Education, 5 (02), 162-173. https://doi.org/10.17509/t.v512.16752

Digdoyo, E. (2018). Kajian Isu Toleransi Beragama, Budaya, dan Tanggung Jawab Sosial Media. JPK: Jurnal Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan, 3 (1), 42-59. https://journal.umpo.ac.id/index.php/JPK/article/view/734/672

Djuniasih, E., & Kosasih, A. (2019). Penerapan Karakter Toleransi Beragama Pada Masyarakat Cigugur yang Pluralisme. Jurnal Pendidikan Karakter, 10 (1), 1-11. https://doi.org/10.21831/jpk.v0i1.22987

Fidiyani, R. (2013). Kerukunan Umat Beragama di Indonesia (Belajar Keharmonisan dan Toleransi Umat Beragama di Desa Cikakak, Kec. Wangon, Kab. Banyumas). Jurnal Dinamika Hukum, 13 (3), 468-462. http://dinamikahukum.fh.unsoed.ac.id/index.php/JDH/article/view/256/247#

Fidiyani, R. (2018). Batas-Batas Kemampuan Hukum dalam Mengatasi Konflik antar Umat Beragama. Semarang: Saraswati Nitisara.

Fitriani, S. (2020). Keberagaman dan Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama. Analisis: Jurnal Studi Keislaman, 20 (2), 179-192. https://doi.org/10.24042/ajsk.v20i2.5489

Hadisaputra, P. (2020). Implementasi Pendidikan Toleransi di Indonesia. Dialog, 43 (1), 75-88. https://doi.org/10.47655/dialog.v43i1.355

Hafidzi, A. (2019). Konsep Toleransi dan Kematangan Agama dalam Konflik Beragama di Masyarakat Indonesia. Potret Pemikiran, 23 (2), 51-61. http://dx.doi.org/10.30984/pp.v23i2.1003

Harmadi, M. (2019). Metafora "Meja Makan" sebagai Upaya Membangun Toleransi di Tengah Kehidupan Masyarakat Indonesia yang Majemuk. Dunamis: Jurnal Teologi dan Pendidikan Kristiani, 4 (1), 99-110. https://doi.org/10.30648/dun.v4i1.193

Hermawati, R., Paskarina, C., & Runiawati, N. (2016). Toleransi Antar Umat Beragama di Kota Bandung. Umbara: Indonesian Journal of Anthropology, 1 (2), 105-124. https://doi.org/10.24198/umbara.v1i2.10341

Hutabarat, B. A., & Panjaitan, H. H. (2016). Tingkat Toleransi Antaragama di Masyarakat Indonesia. Kebijakan Publik: Sebuah Penuaian Konstitusi, 3 (1), 8-34. https://doi.org/10.33550/sd.v3i1.28

Ihsan Ali-Fauzi, I. RI., Rafsadi, I., Sila, M. A., Sumaktoyo, N. G., Nuraniyah, N., Maarif, S., Bagir, Z. A. (2017). Kebebasan, Toleransi dan Terorisme: Riset dan Kebijakan Agama di Indonesia. (Z. A. Ihsan Ali-Fauzi, Ed.) Jakarta: Pusat Studi Agama dan Demokrasi Yayasan Paramadina.

Irwin, C., Ball, L., Desbrow, B., & Leveritt, M. (2012). Students' Perceptions of Using Facebook as An Interactive Learning Resource at University. Australasian Journal of Educational Technology, 28 (7), 1221-1232. http://doi.org/10.14742/ajet.798

Japar, M., Irawaty, & Fadhillah, D. (2019). Peran Pelatihan Penguatan Toleransi Sosial dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Pancasila dan Kewarganegaraan di Sekolah Menengah

Pertama. Jurnal Pendidikan Ilmu Sosial, 29 (2), 94-104.
https://journals.ums.ac.id/index.php/jpis/article/view/8204/5044

Jena, Y. (2019). Toleransi Antarumat Beragama di Indonesia dari Perspektif Etika Kepedulian.
Jurnal Sosial Humaniora (JSH), 12 (2), 183-195.
https://iptek.its.ac.id/index.php/jsh/article/download/5941/4218

Jr, N. T. (1994, July). Maxims in Kant's Moral Philosophy. Retrieved from Department of
Philosophy: https://digitalcommons.unl.edu/philosfacpub/13

Kaha, S. C. (2020). Dialog sebagai Kesadaran Relasional Antaragama: Respons Teologis atas
Pudarnya Semangat Toleransi Kristen-Indonesia di Indonesia. Jurnal Abdiel:
Khazanah Pemikiran Teologi, Pendidikan Agama Kristen dan Musik Gereja, 4 (2),
132-148. https://doi.org/10.37368/ja.v4i2.165

Khattapan, C. N. (2022). The Case Study Research of Examining the Usefulness and Perception
of The Online Teaching Preparation Program. PUPIL: International Journal of
Teaching, Education and Learning, 6(1), 359–372.
https://doi.org/10.20319/pijtel.2022.61.359372

Kitcher, P. (2003). What Is a Maxim? Philosophical Topics, 31 (1/2), pp. 215 - 243.
https://www.jstor.org/stable/43154414

Mangantibe, V. Y., & Taliwuna, M. C. (2021). Toleransi Beragama sebagai Pendekatan Misi
Kristen di Indonesia. Jurnal Ilmiah Religiosity Entity Humanity (JIREH), 3 (1), 33-47.
https://doi.org/10.37364/jireh.v3i1.56

Mayasaroh, K., & Bakhtiar, N. (2020). Toleransi Strategi dalam Membangun Kerukunan
Antarumat Beragama di Indonesia. Al-Afkar, 3 (1), 77-88.
https://doi.org/10.31943/afkar_journal.v3i1,%20January.78

Mengwei, Y. (2012). Tolerance or Hospitality? Frontiers of Philosophy in China, 7 (1), 154-163.
https://doi.org/10.3868/s030-001-012-0009-4

Mohammad Fuad Al Amin, M. R.Amin, M. F., & Rosyidi, M. (2019). The Concept of Tolerance
in Islam and Its Implementation in Indonesian Society. Jurnal Madaniyah, 9 (2), 277-
296. https://journal.stitpemalang.ac.id/index.php/madaniyah/article/view/129

Naim, N. (2016). Abdurrahman Wahid: Universalisme Islam dan Toleransi. Kalam, 10 (2), 423-
444. https://doi.org/10.24042/klm.v10i2.8

Petkova, T. (2019). The Idea of Tolerance -- John Locke and Immanuel Kant. Open Journal for Studies in Philosophy, 3 (1), 17-24. https://doi.org/10.32591/coas.ojsp.0301.03017p

Purwati, P., Darisman, D., & Faiz, A. (2022). Tinjauan Pustaka: Pentingnya Menumbuhkan Nilai Toleransi dalam Praksis Pendidikan. Basicedu Journal of Elementary Education, 6 (3), 3730-3735. https://doi.org/10.31004/basicedu.v6i3.2733

Rahmah, L. A., & Amaludin, A. (2021). Penerapan Interaksi Sosial Antar Masyarakat Melalui Moderasi Beragama dan Sikap Toleransi di Desa Gentasari Kecamatan Kroya Kabupaten Cilacap. To Maega: Jurnal Pengabdian Masyarakat, 4 (3), 341-350. http://dx.doi.org/10.35914/tomaega.v4i3.860

Rodiyah, Rodiyah. (2021). Implementasi Program Merdeka Belajar Kampus Merdeka di Era Digital dalam Menciptakan Karakter Mahasiswa Hukum yang Berkarakter dan Profesional. Seminar Hukum Universitas Negeri Semarang, 7 (2), 425-434. https://doi.org/10.15294/snhunnes.v7i2.737

Said, N. (2017). Pendidikan Toleransi Beragama untuk Humanisme Islam di Indonesia. Edukasia Jurnal Penelitian Pendidikan Islam, 12 (2), 409-434. http://dx.doi.org/10.21043/edukasia.v12i2.2445

Smith, Willian C., et. al. (2017). Global Citizenhip and the Importance of Education in A Globally Integrated World. Globalisation, Societies and Education, 15 (5), 648-665. https://doi.org/10.1080/14767724.2016.1222896

Sodik, F. (2020). Pendidikan Toleransi dan Relevansinya dengan Dinamika Sosial Masyarakat Indonesia. Tsamratul Fikri, 14 (1), 1-14. https://doi.org/10.36667/tf.v14i1.372

Supriyanto, A., & Wahyudi, A. (2017). Skala Karakter Toleransi: Konsep dan Operasional Aspek Kedamaian, Menghargai Perbedaan dan Kesadaran Individu. Counsellia: Jurnal Bimbingan dan Koseling, 7 (2), 61-70. http://doi.org/10.25273/counsellia.v7i2.1710

Sutherland, S., & Jalali, A. (2017). Social Media as An Open-learning Resource in Medical Education: Current Perspectives. Advances in Medical Education and Practices, 369-375. https://doi.org/10.2147/AMEP.S112594

Usman, M., & Widyanto, A. (2019). Internalisasi Nilai-Nilai Toleransi dalam Pembelajaran Pendidikan Agama Islam di SMA Negeri 1 Lhokseumawe. Dayah: Journal of Islamic Education, 2 (1), 36-52. http://dx.doi.org/10.22373/jie.v2i1.2939

Warsah, I., Putra, R., & Morganna, R. (2021). Merging Religiosity on social media: Indonesian Millennial Youth's Understanding of the Concepts of Jihad and Religious Tolerance. Cendekia: Jurnal Kependidikan dan Kemasyarakatan, 19(2), 291-303. https://doi.org/10.21154/cendekia.v19i2.3117

Zhou, Q., Lee, C. S., Sin, S.-C. J., Lin, S., Hu, H., & Ismail, M. F. (2020). Understanding the Use of YouTube as A Learning Resource: A Social Cognitive Perspective. Aslib Journal of Information Management, 72 (3), 339-359. https://doi.org/10.1108/AJIM-10-2019-0290